

**PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION  
MAY 9, 2008  
PRESCOTT, ARIZONA**

MINUTES OF THE **PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION** held on **MAY 9, 2008** in the **CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS** located at **201 S. CORTEZ ST.**, Prescott, Arizona.

**I. CALL TO ORDER**

Chairman Doug Stroh called the meeting to order at 8:00 AM.

**II. ATTENDANCE**

<b>MEMBERS PRESENT</b> Doug Stroh, Chairman Frank DeGrazia, Vice-Chairman Russ Buchanan Don Rantz Elisabeth Ruffner Marv Wright	<b>OTHERS PRESENT</b> George Worley, Assistant Community Development Director Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist Mike Bacon, Community Planner Kelly Sammeli, Recording Secretary
<b>MEMBERS ABSENT</b> Mike Todd	

**III. REGULAR AGENDA**

- 1. Approve the minutes** of the April 11<sup>th</sup>, 2008 meeting.

Mr. Wright, **MOTION: to approve the minutes** as corrected of the April 11, 2008 meeting Mr. Strog, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

- 2. Consider changing the date** of the June, 2008 meeting from June 13, 2008 to June 20, 2008 due to a conflict with the Statewide Historic Preservation Conference.

Mr. Rantz, **MOTION: to change** June Preservation meeting date to June 20, 2008.  
Mr. Buchanan, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

- 3. HP08-010, 147 N. Arizona Avenue.** Prescott Armory Preservation District. APN: 114-04-028 and 028A. Request approval for building permits to install new roofing materials on all 3 buildings (Smoki Museum, Pueblo and Library) and to install new HVAC unit and electrical upgrade. Owner is The Smoki Museum. Applicant is Otwell and Associates. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess. Community Planner, Mike Bacon.

*Mr. DeGrazia recused himself from this item due to a potential conflict of interest and left the dais.*

Mr. Bacon reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposed request is to recoat the existing foam roof with a new layer of foam and to install new heating and cooling units to all three buildings: Museum, Pueblo, and Library;
- the project is compatible with the Master Plan;
- the proposed remodeling will not have an impact on the historic integrity of the property; and,
- staff recommends approval.

Commissioners queried and remarked on:

- If it is possible to paint the units the same color as the buildings;

Scott Westbrook, Otwell and Associates, 121 E. Goodwin Street, stated that painting over the units would be possible as long as it didn't hinder the reading of the information plaques located on the units. He also stated that the units will be located far back from the parapet wall and will not be visible from the north, west, or the south sides of the property and, the neighbors to the east would not be affected either.

Ms. Ruffner, **MOTION:** to approve the request to recoat the roof and replace the HVAC units at all three of the locations: the Museum, Pueblo and Library located at, 147 North Arizona Street, APN: 114-04-028. Mr. Buchanan, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 5-0-1** (*recused DeGrazia*)

4. **HP08-011, 231 S. Mount Vernon Avenue.** Southeast Prescott, Historic Preservation District # 13. APN: 110-01-073. Request approval for building permits to replace and expand a rear deck, add a new carport, and install a new bay window and dormer. Owner/Applicant is Robert L. Beyea. Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the staff report and indicated:

- the proposed request is for a new driveway cut and to construct a new carport; replace front window with a bay window, install dormer on the front façade, and to remove, replace and enlarge the rear deck;
- some of the items will have an impact on the historical integrity of the building;
- most significant will be the addition of the carport on the south side, i.e., the front of the property;
- there is a 20' drop in elevation from living space to alley;
- it is nearly impossible to access home from the rear without having stairs;
- a new driveway cut and carport is being installed for owner with disability to access the house;
- the carport will have a hip roof with one post to match the posts on the porch;
- the carport will be less obtrusive than a garage; and,
- that each item applicant is requesting be discussed separately.

Commissioners queried the carport:

- replicating column for carport [Ms. Burgess: the carport will be seen as new construction];
- the steep drop in elevation and short distance from front of property;
- will carport be raised or the sidewalk dropped;

Mr. Robert Beyea, 231 S. Mount Vernon Avenue, stated that the slope is acceptable for the carport and the slab will sit slightly above ground level to make it level with the front entrance and the porch.

Commissioners further queried:

- how many trees will be removed; [Mr. Beyea: two.]
- will the new structure affect the eligibility for Historic Registry [Ms. Burgess: It will have some affect on the historic integrity but not enough to de-list. However, the mitigating factor is the existing disability. This is something that will make this house useable for this family and is something that needs to be done.]

Ms. Ruffner stated that the whole Preservation movement is centered towards retaining structures and neighborhoods, and to accommodate a person's needs along with the preservation should be a common goal.

Ms. Burgess reviewed the next item which is the dormer to the front façade:

- the elevation was shown;
- the house has a large hip roof and it is the desire of the property owner to break that up;
- the elevation in the front will be changed and, will have some impact on the historical integrity of the property.

Mr. Beyea stated that one functional use of the dormer is to allow light over the staircase that goes to the basement.

Commissioners queried the dormer:

- the overall size of the dormer;
- the dormer appears to be out of proportion, perhaps it needs to be larger;
- the glazing could be increased;
- the dormer seems to have a two or three foot overhang;
- adding possibly four windows and, reduce the overhang to give it more massing;
- or adding three equal size windows would be more compatible;
- final recommendation is using the stained glass window in the center and having two equal size windows to flank the stained glass window; and, this is a reversible change.

Ms. Burgess continued to review staff report with item three, to replace a non-original Front window with bay window of the same size and configuration:

- a bay window will not have any substantial effect on the historic integrity of the building; and,
- the fenestration will read the same way; it fits within the original window opening.

Commissioners queried the bay window:

- the windows in front are similar but not the same size;
- how far the bay window will pop out;
- how the roof will be treated; and,
- how the bay window will be finished.

Mr. Beyea stated he did not know.

Commissioners further queried and discussed how the window could be installed and what type of finish could be utilized:

- would it require a new separate base?
- will the window just hang with brackets?
- a recommendation of having a separate roof on top of the bay window would be preferred;
- the underneath of the bay window should have a flat base, no brackets;
- try to mimic the other windows with fixed panes;
- no horizontal mullions;
- casement or fixed windows; and,
- will the bay window be prefab or built on site?

Commissioner Stroh, summarized the discussion by repeating the recommendations of having a separate roof above the bay window, preferably accented with copper, or shingles to match. Commission approves no horizontal mullions, no base coming down, just a flat base, no attachments down below. Windows can be fixed or casement.

Ms. Burgess the next item to discuss is the rear deck:

- currently there is a spiral staircase that is in poor condition;
- the applicant wants to remove it completely and build a new deck with a separate set of stairs;
- new stairs to have a post the same as the porch; and,
- the deck will only be accessible from the inside of the house.

Commissioners queried:

- having no stairs from deck to the back yard would be less massive;
- does existing design go from the carport to the deck? and;
- approving only one stairway from the carport to the lower level.

Ms. Burgess again stated that she recommends that the Commission take each item in order and, make only one motion with the changes discussed.

Mr. Stroh, **MOTION: to approve HP08-011, 231 S. Mount Vernon Avenue** with the following request to: 1.) Construct a new driveway cut and carport on the south side of the house; 2.) The addition of a dormer, which will consist of three equal size windows one of which will be stained glass to be located in the center, keeping one foot overhang on either side of the front façade of the dormer; 3.)The placement of a bay window the same size as the existing window to replace existing window in front of the house, and the bay window will consist of casement or fixed panes, no horizontal mullions, a separate roof, preferably copper, a flat bottom, with no base; 4.) Expand and reconstruct of the rear deck. Mr. Rantz, 2<sup>nd</sup>, **Vote: 6-0.**

Mr. Buchanan was excused due to a prior commitment. A break in the meeting was taken from 8:55 to 8:58.

5. **HP08-012, 934 Apache Drive.** Pine Crest Historic Preservation District #10. APN: 108-01 063. Request approval for a building permit to remodel existing kitchen into a sunroom; remodel rear/west side of house to include upgraded kitchen area; removal of south facing

kitchen door and re-siding; installation of French doors in place of existing window; upgrade the electrical box. Owners are Andy & Candace Tomlinson. Applicant is Foreste Holmes, LLC, Historic Preservation Specialist, Nancy Burgess.

Ms. Burgess suggested that the same procedure as previous case be followed for this request and then reviewed the staff report:

- this house has two kitchens;
- the house has several additions, including a 2<sup>nd</sup> story addition that was approved by the Commission several years ago;
- this is an interior remodel with some exterior elements;
- the proposal is to remove the kitchen from the southeast corner and turn it into a sunroom;
- the proposal is to remove the existing kitchen door and side over the area to match the siding;
- the electrical box will be upgraded but will stay in the same location;
- the proposal is to replace kitchen windows with in kind windows.

Eric Foreste, Foreste Homes Contractors, 2006 Dineh, stated that:

- the drawings for the windows are from Pella;
- the windows will be reflect low-e glass;
- the grille pieces will remain as small as possible as it is not a true divide;
- the new windows look very similar to the original window.

Ms. Burgess stated that the windows need to look exactly like the original windows.

Eric Foreste stated they will, Pella guaranteed that they will look the same.

Ms. Burgess stated basically the grilles between the glass are not going to work. They need to be 3-D on the outside of the window. The interior is up to the homeowner but the outside needs to keep the historic integrity of the building intact. She continued to state:

- the muntins must be on the exterior of the window;
- the kitchen window will be replaced;
- the exterior will include closing off the door on the west side;
- the center panel of the window will be replaced with French doors;
- the existing flanking windows will be replaced with new windows;
- next item is to replace all necessary plumbing and electrical, including the electrical box which was previously discussed; and,
- the area on the west side of the house where the triple windows are located will not have a negative effect on the historic integrity of the building.

Commissioners queried:

- the location of the French doors will be behind raised flower beds;
- don't see any further issues;

Mr. Wright, **MOTION:** to approve HP08-012, 924 Apache Drive, as submitted.

Mr. Stroh, 2<sup>nd</sup>. **Vote: 6-0.**

Ms. Ruffner gave an overview of Pine Crest and the house.

#### **IV. SUMMARY OF CURRENT OR RECENT EVENTS**

1. Conference brochures from the National Alliance of Preservation Commission to be held in New Orleans in July of this year.
2. Format changes will be taking place to keep consistency with that of the City Clerk for all Boards and Commissions.
3. Councilman Bell will read proclamation of "National Preservation Month, 2008" at City Council meeting on May 13, 2008.
4. Elisabeth Ruffner announced that Nancy Burgess was chosen as a 2008 Culture Keeper for 2008. Award will be presented on September 28, 2008.
5. On Tuesday, May 13, 2008 at the City Council meeting, Nancy Burgess will be presenting the Elisabeth Ruffner awards for Excellence In Historic Preservation to Ms. Silva Neely and to the Jenner family of Skull Valley. Refreshments will be served.

#### **V. ADJOURNMENT**

Chairman Stroh adjourned the meeting at 9:18 AM.

---

Doug Stroh, Chairman