

PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION
REGULAR MEETING / PUBLIC HEARING
SEPTEMBER 11, 2009
PRESCOTT, ARIZONA

MINUTES of the PRESCOTT PRESERVATION COMMISSION held on SEPTEMBER 11, 2009 in COUNCIL CHAMBERS, CITY HALL, 201 S. CORTEZ STREET, PRESCOTT, ARIZONA.

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Stroh called the meeting to order at 8:00 AM.

II. ATTENDANCE

MEMBERS PRESENT Doug Stroh, Chairman Russ Buchanan Frank DeGrazia John Langellier Elisabeth Ruffner	OTHERS PRESENT George Worley, Asst. Community Development Director Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist Cat Moody, Applications Mgr., GIS Coordinator Mike Bacon, Community Planner Kelly Sammeli, Recording Secretary
MEMBERS ABSENT Steve Adams Mike Todd	COUNCIL PRESENT Lora Lopas, Councilwoman

III. REGULAR AGENDA

1. Consider approval of the minutes of the July 10, 2009 meeting.

Mr. Langellier, **MOTION: to approve** the minutes of the July 10, 2009 meeting.
Ms. Ruffner, 2nd.
VOTE: 5-0.

2. Consider approval of the minutes of the August 14, 2009 meeting.

Ms. Ruffner, **MOTION: to approve** the minutes of the August 14, 2009 meeting.
Mr. DeGrazia, 2nd.
VOTE: 5-0.

3. **HP09-025, 944 ½ Apache Drive.** Historic Preservation District # 10, Pine Crest. APN: 108-01-085. Request to replace five (5) single-pane aluminum windows in the addition (944 1/2 Apache Drive) with wood windows in similar style to the main house (944 Apache). Owner/Applicant is Betty Newell. Catherine Moody, Historic Preservation Specialist.

Ms. Moody, placed a photograph of the property on the overhead projector and reported that the property is associated with 944 Apache Drive and is located within the Pine Crest National Register District. Continuing, Ms. Moody noted that the applicants have requested to replace the non-original, single-pane

aluminum slider windows with wood windows similar in style to the main house at 944 Apache Drive. Ms Moody closed her report by describing the various window details supplied by Builders Wholesale and offering that the windows will be installed by Foreste Contractors.

Chairman Stroh called for questions or comments from the Commissioners.

Ms. Ruffner inquired if the window openings were original and if the slider window would be replaced with two double hung windows or one large double hung window.

Ms. Moody reported that all the window openings are original, the sizes and locations of the windows will not change and, the slider window will be replaced with only one window. Ms. Moody further indicated that Eric Forest was present to explain the installation.

Mr. Eric Foreste, Foreste Homes General Contractors indicated that the proposed windows are a fiberglass construction that are made to look like real wood and are designed to resemble the windows in the old house.

Chairman Stroh inquired why the replacement of window "C" which is a 48" H x 72" W was not being replaced by a pair of single hung windows instead of the casement picture window.

Mr. Forest explained that the home was a block structure and the owner wanted to do the least expensive replacement. Mr. Forest added that the option of two windows was never discussed.

Chairman Stroh indicated that he thought it would be more appropriate to do pair of windows and asked Mr. Forest if there are windows six feet wide that will crank open.

Mr. Forest noted that he thought it was fixed window.

Ms. Ruffner offered that during the era that the house and the addition were built "picture windows" were typical.

Mr. DeGrazia inquired if the windows were made of fiberglass or wood, as the application noted that they would be wood.

Ms. Moody added that it was also her understanding that the windows would be wood.

Mr. Forest indicated that they were a fiberglass window that looks just like wood.

Ms. Moody reported that the applicant was made aware that the windows had to be wood.

Ms. Betty Newell, 944 W. Apache Drive explained that the casement window does not face the street and will not affect the appearance of the house. Her

daughter, who was unable to attend the meeting, knows more about the windows.

Mr. DeGrazia asked Ms. Newell if she could clarify if the windows would be wood.

Ms. Newell indicated that her daughter had made all the arrangements and she would have to defer Mr. Foreste.

Mr. Foreste indicated that if the Preservation Commission would prefer wood windows that is what they would install.

Ms. Ruffner, **MOTION: to approve HP09-025** with the following condition of approval: 1) comply with Agency comments listed within the memo dated September 1, 2009 which states replacement of five non-original windows with new wood windows in a similar style to the main house.

Mr. DeGrazia, 2nd. VOTE: 5-0.

4. **HP09-026, 114-122 S. Montezuma Street.** Historic Preservation District # 1, Courthouse Plaza. APN: 109-02-011. Request is to clean all brick and stone work on the front and rear; the removal and replacement of Terra-cotta fillet ledge sections with precast concrete on the front of The Palace. Owners are M& I Trust Company. Applicant is Nawkaw Pacific Southwest Inc. Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist.

Ms. Burgess reported that the proposal was to do a major clean up on the building known as "The Palace". The majority of the work will be to clean the brick and stone on the building. However, part of proposal is to replace the deteriorated Terra-cotta fillet trim on the front of the building with a cast concrete element. Ms. Burgess placed a photograph of the area on the overhead projector and noted that the right hand side of the building (the north side) is in the worst condition. Continuing, Ms. Burgess noted that they intend to take a piece of the Terra-cotta and use it as a mold to cast concrete pieces to replace the broken or missing Terra-cotta. The replacement pieces of cast concrete will be color stained to match the existing Terra-cotta. In addition, there will be some clean up of the brick work and repairs in the back of the building, where they will also "stain match" the brick. There will be a permit required to work in the City right-of-way on the front of the building. Ms. Burgess further reported that she had done some research on the Terra-cotta replacement concept and had found information in Chapter 7 of "The Preservation of Historic Architecture" (Preservation Briefs), which is published by the United States Department of the Interior that indicated that precast concrete units can be cast hollow, and can be colored or stained to match Terra-cotta, with excellent results. Ms. Burgess also noted that she had checked into the replacement process of Terra-cotta by manufacturers and indicated that it was a very involved process. Ms. Burgess closed the report by noting that new Terra-cotta would be the ideal replacement for the broken or missing pieces, however, precast concrete is an acceptable alternative under the Preservation Briefs. Ms. Burgess invited Scott Hammonds,

the agent for the project, to the podium to answer any questions from the Commissioners.

Mr. Scott Hammonds, 6200 South Mesa Vista Drive, Gold Canyon, AZ, representative for Nakaw Pacific Southwest, Incorporated introduced himself and inquired if there were any questions.

Mr. DeGrazia commended the owner for making the improvements to the building and then further indicated that he had concerns with the staining of the precast concrete because the Terra-cotta was colored through and through. Mr. DeGrazia added that the stain could fade off of the concrete within a couple of years and the area would stick out even more than it does with the broken, missing pieces.

Mr. Hammonds offered that at his company, Nakaw Corporation manufactures their own stain products. Mr. Hammonds indicated that his company has done many Main Street historical projects over the years and his company provides a guarantee that the stain will not fade for at least 25 years; and if it does fade, they will fix it to the correct shade. Mr. Hammonds explained that once they have approval by the Commission, they would order the pieces from Mesa Concrete in Phoenix, who cast all kinds of ornamental pieces from molds.

The pieces are approximately 23" wide by 15-16" deep and once cast they will be hollowed out to make them lighter. The pieces will be put back in place, the whole building will be cleaned and then the stain will be applied on the new concrete pieces to match to old Terra-cotta pieces. Mr. Hammonds added that when the building is completed, a person should not be able to tell the difference between the old Terra-cotta and new pieces. Mr. Hammonds reiterated that with the 25 year warranty, if there ever is a shading difference they will come back and fix it.

Mr. DeGrazia inquired what the cost difference was between the cast concrete and the Terra-cotta.

Mr. Hammonds indicated that the cost of the Terra-cotta was three times more than the cast concrete. Mr. Hammonds added that he did check with a supplier in Boston that could make the pieces from Terra-cotta, however, by the time the pieces were made and shipped it would be too costly for the property owner.

Mr. DeGrazia inquired if it made sense to color the concrete with a dye when it is cast.

Mr. Hammonds noted that is something that could be done but it would be impossible to match the original Terra-cotta and they would still have to stain the pieces. The product that they will use will have water repellent in it, so it will help protect the pieces.

Mr. Buchanan inquired if other things would be done to the building.

Mr. Hammonds reported that in the front of the building, there are several bricks that have holes and they will be filled in with epoxy and color stained to match the rest of the bricks.

Mr. Buchanan inquired if the previous repairs on the building made would also be redone.

Mr. Hammond noted that they would only be fixing the holes that are currently there.

Mr. Buchanan inquired how the new cast concrete pieces will be anchored on the building.

Mr. Hammonds reported that 95% of the piece is on the ledge of the building, and they will be kept down in place with epoxy. The pieces will be manufactured longer and cut down to slide together.

Mr. Buchanan inquired if the pieces could be cast in a colored concrete through and through as Mr. DeGrazia described, so if they did fade they would fade towards a color similar to the Terra-cotta and not the gray concrete color.

Mr. Hammonds noted that was something they could do however, they would have to agree on a default color.

Mr. Buchanan offered he thought that it would be better than the gray concrete.

Mr. Hammonds indicated that the stain is a penetrating stain so it will penetrate the pieces. Mr. Hammonds stressed again that they guarantee that the pieces would not fade for at least 25 years.

Mr. DeGrazia inquired what would be done with the stamped metal work on the building (in the pediment).

Mr. Hammond noted that the metal work would be lightly cleaned first and if it is needed it will be coated with rust inhibitor to further protect it as it old and frail.

Mr. DeGrazia inquired if Mr. Hammonds would provide the Commission with the name of some of the buildings they have restored with the precast concrete.

Mr. Hammond noted that the restored buildings have not been around Arizona. They have been in areas of Georgia, Pennsylvania and Chicago however, he would happy to get the references. Mr. Hammonds further added that on the back of the building they will be cleaning the brick and color matching the brick so the doors and windows that were filled in with different brick will not be noticeable any more.

Mr. DeGrazia inquired about cleaning the soft mortar between the brick in the rear of the building.

Mr. Hammonds noted that the majority of the cleaning would be by hand.

Chairman Stroh asked Ms. Burgess what her opinion was on changing the color of the infill brick in the rear as he felt that it told a story.

Ms. Burgess indicated that with the header left behind it will still tell the story.

Mr. DeGrazia asked Ms. Burgess her opinion on the use of the precast concrete vs. the Terra-cotta.

Ms. Burgess indicated that the best choice would be to recast the Terra-cotta. However, she was aware that the cost is prohibitive. Ms. Burgess added that having the building cleaned will be good, and since the process is allowed by the Secretary's Standards, it is acceptable for the condition of the building.

Chairman Stroh noted that he has good luck with staining of concrete blocks and since the color is a lighter color and the sun light is of an eastern exposure it should not be an issue.

Ms. Ruffner indicated that she is in support of the project although she would have liked to see more of what the company has provided.

Chairman Stroh called for a motion.

Mr. Langellier, **MOTION: to approve** with modifications, HP09-026, 114-120 South Montezuma Street, with the following conditions of approval: 1. Comply with Agency comments listed within the memo dated September 1, 2009 which calls for the following five points; 1) the use of cast concrete elements for the replacement of the damaged Terra-cotta fillet elements; 2) that the precast concrete replacement units be cast directly from an original, existing, undamaged piece of the Terra-cotta fillet elements; 3) that the precast concrete replacement elements be tinted or stained to match the originals once the original elements have been cleaned; 4) that the above recommendation from Chapter 7, "The Preservation of Historic Glazed Architectural Terra-Cotta" of The Preservation of Historic Architecture, published by the United States Department of the Interior regarding cleaning of historic masonry be followed in the cleaning of the brick and the Terra-cotta elements on the building; and, 5) any other conditions which may become apparent as a result of the analysis of this project.

Chairman Stroh, 2nd. **VOTE: 5-0.**

5. **HP09-027, 160 S. Montezuma Street.** Historic Preservation District # 1, Courthouse Plaza. APN: 109-02-019. Request to install new 6' by 2' neon display sign for new business "Chubs". Owner is John S. Thorup. Applicant is PV Signs. Nancy Burgess, Historic Preservation Specialist.

Ms. Burgess reported that the proposal was for a replacement sign for an existing business which was "Quizno's" and will now be known as "Chub's". The location is allowed to have fifty square feet of signage per the *Land Development Code* and the total square footage of the proposed sign is twelve square feet. The proposed sign will be a perpendicular, wall mounted, neon lighted sign that will be installed centered on the front façade of the building. Ms. Burgess noted that the sign must not protrude more than 36 inches from the face of the wall and the sign will be installed so it protrudes 2' 10" (34"). The sign design is consistent with the historic signage in the downtown in the 1940s and 1950s. Ms. Burgess

closed her report by adding that there are several "grandfathered" perpendicular signs in the downtown area plus some newer ones. Ms. Burgess noted that the applicant was present to answer any questions from the Commission.

Chairman Stroh called for questions or comments from the Commissioners.

Mr. Buchanan inquired if there were any plans to fix the crack in the stucco in the front of the building.

Mr. Bill Mayo, PV Sign Company indicated that it was his understanding that the owner was going to repair all the cracks in the stucco.

Ms. Ruffner indicated that the proposed motion did not require treatment to the façade, only that the repairs be made to the area of the removal of the old sign and inquired if the repair to the stucco should be added to the motion.

Mr. Buchanan inquired if that would be a reasonable request.

Chairman Stroh offered that the area does need to be repainted.

Mr. Mayo indicated that the area is very limited however, to make the paint match it would need to go up to the ledge. (above the storefront & below the parapet)

Ms. Burgess noted that the business owner is not the building owner and the building owner will have to make the arrangements to make the repairs and paint.

Chairman Stroh asked Ms. Burgess if that could be in the motion.

Ms. Burgess indicated that was correct as a recommendation.

Chairman Stroh called for other questions or comments from the Commission. Hearing none called for a motion.

Mr. DeGrazia, **MOTION: to approve HP09-027**, 160 South Montezuma Street, with the following conditions: that the holes left from the previous sign be repaired properly, patched and painted, and the sign as presented to the Commission be approved.

Chairman Stroh inquired if Mr. DeGrazia intended to add that the cracks in the façade are repaired and the entire front façade be painted.

Mr. DeGrazia indicated that he was not sure that it was within the purview of the request, even though he would also like to see it done.

Chairman Stroh asked Ms. Burgess if they could require the cracks to be repaired and the entire façade be painted.

Ms. Burgess recommended that the Commission make it in a form of a request and not a condition for issuance of the permit. Ms. Burgess added that staff could

work with the business owner and the property owner to see if the request would be feasible.

Chairman Stroh inquired if the request could be added to the motion.

Ms. Burgess noted yes the Commission could include the request as part of the motion.

Motion failed for lack of a second.

Chairman Stroh, **MOTION: to approve HP09-027**, for the sign as presented, that the stucco be patched and painted from the existing sign, and request that the owner repair the entire stucco façade and repaint it.

Mr. Langellier, 2nd. **VOTE: 5-0.**

IV. SUMMARY OF RECENT OR CURRENT EVENTS

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Stroh adjourned the meeting at 9:45 AM.


Doug Stroh, Chairman